



**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE
HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING**

DRAFT MINUTES

Monday, August 12, 2019

**Scottsdale Community Design Studio
7506 E Indian School Road
Scottsdale, Arizona 85251**

PRESENT: Nadia Mustafa, Chair
Janice Shimokubo, Vice Chair
Laurie Coe
James Eaneman
Emily Hinchman
Hannellie Mendoza
Stuart Rhoden

STAFF: Sharon Cini
Bill Hylan

GUESTS: Alan Rodbell, Police Chief
Jared Van Weelde
Hugh Lockerby
Rich Garret
Sandy Schenkat
Tory Roberg
Luke Douglas
Emily Austin

Call to Order/Roll Call

Chair Mustafa called the meeting to order at 5:05 p.m.

Public Comment

Sandy Schenkat reiterated her comments from the Commission's March meeting, suggesting City Council meetings be opened with a moment of silence instead of an invocation. She noted that the Satanic Temple has filed a lawsuit against the City of Scottsdale for being denied the opportunity to deliver an invocation during a City Council meeting.

Luke Douglas spoke on behalf of the Humanists Society of Greater Phoenix. He commented on the importance of separating church and state. He recommended that the Human Relations Commission make a recommendation to City Council that they eliminate the invocation and replace it with a moment of silence.

Emily Austin spoke in favor of City Council replacing the invocation with a moment of silence. She stressed that having a representative from certain religious groups speak at the beginning of City Council meetings alienates many people regardless of what the religion is. She was offended by the fact that City Council members discussed their own personal religious beliefs when making the decision to exclude the Satanic Temple from doing an invocation. She commented about the lawsuit that is ensuing between the Satanic Temple and the City of Scottsdale, recommending that City Council eliminate the invocation and instead have a moment of silence.

Tory Roberg, representing the Secular Coalition for Arizona, spoke about the negative aspects of having mandatory prayer during public meetings and the separation of church and state. She opined that any form of prayer, even non-denominational prayer, inevitably excludes many citizens. The Secular Coalition believes the best practice is to eliminate prayer from government activities. She asked that the Human Relations Commission agendaize a discussion on the topic.

1. Approval of minutes from the June 10, 2019 meeting

COMMISSIONER HINCHMAN MOVED TO APPROVE THE JUNE 10, 2019 HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES. VICE-CHAIR SHIMOKUBO SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0). CHAIR MUSTAFA, VICE-CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, COMMISSIONERS COE, EANEMAN, HINCHMAN, MENDOZA, AND RHODEN VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

2. Presentation, discussion and recommendations on ideas to mitigate adverse experiences related to prejudice or insensitivity to diversity at city-sponsored events and ways to address incidents, if reported

Cheryl Sumners, Events Manager, talked about the City of Scottsdale event review process. She said that event producers could benefit from advice on handling unexpected occurrences that might happen during their event.

Ms. Cini presented a draft of helpful hints, including methods, statements, and actions that could be shared with event producers to help them address any racist comments or actions that might occur during their event. Ideas include suggesting that event producers announce that they support City of Scottsdale values and commitments as their own to help ensure that all participants feel welcome and safe; they could consider providing an advance system of

communications and resources to their team members; and they could ensure that ADA accommodation information is made available to the public in their event materials. The City could offer to attend an event planning meeting to answer any questions. Ms. Cini noted that for Parada del Sol 2020 it has been suggested that volunteers walk with groups so that incidents can be recognized and addressed immediately.

Discussion ensued regarding the idea of offering suggestions on how to handle racist events. It was suggested that the Office of Diversity offer event producers a sign to hang at the entrances, advocating for diversity and a welcoming and inclusive environment.

Continued discussion about what an informational document could include will be agendaized for a future meeting.

3. Presentation, discussion and recommendations on 2019 Human Relations Commission strategic plan

- **Commissioner updates**

Chair Mustafa announced that after six years, this is Commissioner Coe's final meeting. She thanked her for her hard work and dedication.

Ms. Cini invited Commissioner Coe to attend a future meeting, so that they can be prepared to give her a proper thank you.

Commissioner Coe spoke about her years on the Commission.

Chair Mustafa announced that she has completed her three-year term and the September meeting will be her final meeting.

Chair Mustafa said that the Economic Development team published content about Scottsdale for All in their July newsletter.

Commissioner Rhoden commented that Dinner and Dialogue has been successful and he opined that the City is ready to move forward with more frequent events. He supported the idea of including a larger group community forum, similar to the format used for the Regional Human Relations meeting. Commissioners agreed that the STOP group would be a good place to start with the larger forum.

Ms. Cini said that she and Commissioners Hinchman and Mendoza met with Doc Jones from the Jazz Foundation and Be Kind Project representatives to discuss Golden Rule Day. McCormick Stillman Railroad Park is available to hold the event at the end of April 2020.

- **Review outreach opportunities for 2019/20**

Ms. Cini presented a list of Commission outreach opportunities for FY 2019/20, which included:

- World Gay Rodeo Finals - October 24 -27, 2019
- Dia de los Muertos - November 2, 2019 (LORE Productions on 2nd Street near Old Adobe Mission)

- Arizona Asian Festival - November 16 - 17, 2019
- Scottsdazzle - December 2019
- Canal Convergence - December 2019
- Peace and Community Day - January 19, 2020
- Regional Unity Walk - January 25, 2020
- Arizona Indian Festival - February 8 - 9, 2020
- Golden Rule Day - April 2020
- Phoenix Pride Parade - April 2020

4. Presentation, discussion, and recommendation regarding local incident of racism

- **Hate crime prevention**

Detective Jared Van Weelde and Lieutenant Hugh Lockerby discussed how the City of Scottsdale handles hate crimes and they specifically addressed the recent hate crime involving Dr. Sproat. They said that although it is clear that a crime occurred with Dr. Sproat, there is not enough evidence at this time to continue the investigation. Evidence in that case had been handled by too many people to do an analysis.

So far in 2019, there have been three harassment crimes that have been designated as hate crimes. Hate crimes in Arizona are investigated as harassment and there are no specific funds designated towards hate crimes. If a crime is designated as a hate crime, the prosecuting attorney has the ability during sentencing to request that the judge in the case enhance sentencing. The police department has the ability to provide education by training school resource officers on ways to speak to youth and other ways to prevent hate crimes and by making police representatives available to talk to the community and encouraging people to file a report when they believe they have been the victim of a hate crime. Crimes are designated as a hate crime based on whether the action was directed towards a characteristic of the person, such as race, ethnicity, sexual orientation, or religion.

Scottsdale Police Department does not make case information available to the public or the media. In the case of Dr. Sproat, she chose to call the media and publicize the crime.

- **Possible ways the city can respond to these types of incidents**

Ms. Cini said that the incident experienced by Dr. Sproat prompted her to form Scottsdale Together Overcoming Prejudice (STOP). The organization is a group of concerned neighbors who believe positive change comes through respect, understanding, education, awareness, action, and strength in numbers. They seek to strengthen Scottsdale as a safe and welcoming city for all. Their next meeting is scheduled for August 24, 2019 from 2:30 p.m. to 4:30 p.m. The group hopes to create a large event celebrating diversity and to create a scholarship fund. They are also discussing creating a diversity response team, monthly newsletters, book club outreach, and story times.

Discussion ensued regarding continuing efforts to encourage City Council to institute an Anti-Discrimination Ordinance and ways in which the City and the State can discourage discrimination and encourage a welcoming environment for all.

CHAIR MUSTAFA MOVED THAT STAFF DRAFT A LETTER TO CITY COUNCIL SUGGESTING THEY WRITE A LETTER OF ACKNOWLEDGEMENT TO THE VICTIM OF A RECENT HATE CRIME AND SUGGESTING THAT THEY MAKE A PUBLIC STATEMENT THAT THEY DO NOT CONDONE HATE. VICE-CHAIR SHIMOKUBO SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0). CHAIR MUSTAFA, VICE-CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, COMMISSIONERS COE, EANEMAN, HINCHMAN, MENDOZA, AND RHODEN VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

5. Identification of Future Agenda Items

Suggested agenda items include:

- Discussion on making a list of ideas for mitigating racist incidents
- Strategic planning
- Panhandling signage
- Discussion regarding the City Council invocation

Any further agenda topics can be forwarded to Ms. Cini prior to August 26, 2019.

The next meeting is scheduled for September 9, 2019.

Adjournment

COMMISSIONER SHIMOKUBO MOVED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING. COMMISSIONER RHODEN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0). CHAIR MUSTAFA, VICE-CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, COMMISSIONERS COE, EANEMAN, HINCHMAN, MENDOZA, AND RHODEN VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

With no further business to discuss, being duly moved and seconded, the meeting adjourned at 6:34 p.m.

Recorded and Transcribed by eScribers, LLC.